Interaction between lactic acid bacteria and yeasts in sour-dough using a rheofermentometer

M. Gobbetti,* A. Corsetti and J. Rossi

Rheofermentometer assays were used to characterize the leavening of sour-doughs produced using species of lactic acid bacteria (LAB) and yeasts, alone or in combination. Saccharomyces cerevisiae 141 produced the most CO₂ and ethanol whereas S. exiguus M14 and Lactobacillus brevis subsp. lindneri CB1 contributed poorly to leavening and gave sour-doughs without porosity. In comparison with that seen in sour-dough produced with yeast alone, yeast fermentation with heterofermentative LAB present was faster whereas that with homofermentative LAB (L. plantarum DC400, L. farciminis CF3) present was slower and produced more CO,. Combining L. brevis subsp. lindneri CB1 with S. cerevisiae 141 decreased bacterial cell numbers and souring activity. However, addition of fructose to the sour-dough overcame these problems as well as activating S. cerevisiae 141.

Key words: Lactic acid bacteria, rheofermentometer, sour-dough, yeasts.

Associations between lactic acid bacteria (LAB) and yeasts are widely used in the production of beverages and fermented foods, including wheat and rye sour-dough breads (Devoyod & Desmazeaud 1971; Obelman 1985; Wood & Hodge 1985; Obelman 1985; Gobbetti 1992). The constitutive microflora of wheat sour-dough has been investigated in some detail and various species of homo- and heterofermentative LAB and yeasts have been identified (Kline & Sugihara 1971; Sugihara et al. 1971; Barber et al. 1983; Spicher 1987; Galli et al. 1988; Sarra et al. 1992; Gobbetti et al. 1994). Homofermentative LAB are responsible for development of sour-dough bread with a good grain and elastic crumb (Spicher 1983), whereas the heterofermentative LAB improve its taste (Spicher 1983; Salovaara 1993) and con- $\frac{1}{2}$ tribute to the leavening process. However, the leavening of leavening of $\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{1}{2}$ sour-dough is fundamentally determined by the $CO₂$ produced through the fermentative activity of the yeasts present (Spicher 1983). The $CO₂$ is retained by the wheat gluten which is stretched into a visco-elastic film (Akdogan θ ² de Ozagen 1992; Which immerices four-volume and cram

dough leavening is greatly influenced by the composition of the flour used and by the metabolic interactions between LAB and yeasts. Gobbetti et al. (1994a, b, c) investigated some aspects of carbohydrate and amino-acid metabolism in sour-doughs. Martinez-Anaya et al. (1990) showed the additive effect of some LAB on the gassing power of Saccharomyces cerevisiae and Corsetti et al. (1994) evaluated the effects of increasing soluble carbohydrates in enhancing the LAB fermentation.

In the present study, a rheofermentometer is used to characterize the leavening of wheat sour-dough by LAB and yeast starters, alone or combined.

Materials and Methods

Microorganisms and Media The Lactobacillw breois subsp. lindneri CBI (heterofermentative), L.

plantarum Decesium Decesium Determentum Diplomative, plantarum DC400 (homofermentative), L. farciminis CF3 (homofermentative), Saccharomyces cerevisiae 141 (maltose-positive) and S. exiguus M14 (maltose-negative) used had all been isolated from wheat sour-dough (Gobbetti & Rossi 1991; Gobbetti et al. 1994). The lactic acid bacteria (LAB) and yeasts were pre-cultured in SDB broth (Kline & Sugihara 1971) and Sabouraud broth (Difco), respectively, for 24 h at 28°C. The cells were harvested by centrifugation at 10,000 $\times g$ for 10 min and washed twice with sterile distilled water. Baker's yeast (68% moisture) was purchased from local bakeries.

 T authors are with the Institute of Dairy Microbiology, Faculty of Γ The authors are with the Institute of Dairy Microbiology, Faculty of Agriculture, University of Perugia, S. Costanzo, 06126 Perugia, Italy, fax: 75 32387. *Corresponding author.

M. Gobbetti, A. Corsetti and J. Rossi

Dough Kneading and Addition of Soluble Carbohydrates

The characteristics of the type O wheat flour used were: moisture, 15.4%; protein (N \times 5.70), 10.7% dry matter (d.m.); fat, 1.8% d.m.; ash, 0.6% d.m. The Chopin Alveograph P value (M. Chopin, Boulogne, France) was 82.95. Wheat flour (250 g) and tap water (130 ml) containing 7 g prepared starter cells (14 g in the case of the combinations of microorganisms) or baker's yeast were used to produce the dough. Depending on the dry weight of the cells, the amount of tap water was modified in order to give a constant final dough yield of 155. When fructose was added, its final concentration was 6 g/kg dough. Doughs were produced with a continuous high speed mixer (60 \times g) (M. Chopin). The total dough mixing time was 5 min (I min mixing, 2 min stop, 2 min mixing).

Rheofermentometer Trials

The Chopin Rheofermentometer F₂ (Groupe Tripette et Renaud Villeneuve-La-Garenne, Cedex, France) is equipped with a thermostat-controlled, l-l fermentation chamber containing a perforated (0.4~mm pore) aluminum vessel connected to a recorder. After mixing with the starter, 315 g dough were placed in the vessel, pressed with a 2-kg, cylindrical weight and the chamber hermetically closed. Fermentation was at 28°C for 3 h and the volume of CO_{2} liberated through the perforated vessel wa recorded by an electronic microprocessor. The leavening process is described in terms of: V_t , the area delimited by the upper line of the gas release curve, corresponding to the total volume of $CO₂$ (ml) produced during 3 h of fermentation; $V_t/2$, the total volume of CO, (ml) produced after 1.5 h of fermentation; V_n , the area delimited by the lower line of the gas release curve, corresponding to the total volume of $CO₂$ (ml) retained in the sour-dough; R_c the $CO₂$ retention coefficient V_r/V_b , the area between the upper and lower lines being a measure of the amount of $CO₂$ liberated from the dough and therefore also the porosity of the dough; $H_{\mu\nu}$ the maximum height (mm) of the upper curve; $T₁$, the time (min) to reach the maximum curve height; X, the maximum gas flow (mm/min) (H_m/T_1) ; and T_m , the time (min) when the porosity of the dough develops (point of separation between the upper and lower lines).

The rheofermentometer was calibrated according to the manufacturer's instructions except that NaCl was excluded and the effective mixing time was reduced to 3 min. Cell concentrations in the dough (7 g) and the temperature of fermentation (28°C) were selected to give a leavening time (3 h) compatible with the performance of the rheofermentometer.

Cell counts

LAB and yeast cell numbers were estimated on SDB (Kline & Sugihara 1971) and Sabouraud (Difco) agars, respectively, after 72 h incubation at 28°C.

Determination of Organic Acids and Ethanol

A 10-g sample of leavened sour-dough (3 h) was diluted with distilled water (90 ml), homogenized with a Classic Blender (PBI International, Milan, Italy), mixed at 100 \times g for 30 min and centrifuged at 12,000 \times g for 30 min. D- and t-lactic acid, acetic acid and ethanol contents were determined in the supematant using commercial, enzymatic kits (Boeringher-Mannheim, Milan, Italy). Each value given in the Results is the mean for three replicate sour-dough fermentations, each analysed twice. Standard deviations (SD) and coefficients of variation (CV) were calculated (Stanton 1988).

Results and Discussion

The reproducibility of each of the parameters measured with the rheofermentometer was determined on six replicates using 5. cerevisiae 141; all showed good reproducibility, with V_t , $V_{t/2}$, V_n , R_c , H_m and T_r having CV < 2.1% (Table 1).

Sour-dough Fermentation with Individual Starters

Sour-doughs were initially produced with commercial baker's yeast and CO,-producing starters (yeasts and heterofermentative LAB). The fermentation with commercial baker's yeast was characterized by a V_t of 1513 ml (Table 2). The cell count after the 3 h fermentation was similar to the initial value and ethanol production was 179 mmol/kg (Table 3). The ratio between the molar concentrations of CO, and ethanol produced was I:I.

The sour-dough fermentation with S. cerevisiae 141 showed only slight differences to that with commercial baker's yeast (Figure 1A) with V_t and ethanol concentration of 1437 ml and 170 mmol/kg, respectively (Tables 2 and 3). Due to the longer time (63 min) necessary to reach maximum gas production, a reduction in the flow speed from 1.51 to 1.06 mm/min was observed. Saccharomyces cerevisiae 141 had already produced 66% of its maximum CO, (Table 2) after 1.5 h but gas production continued throughout the 3 h of fermentation. The pH decreased from 5.95 to 5.75 but yeast-cell numbers at the end of leavening were about the same as initial values (Table 3). According to Yondem et al. (1992), the growth of S. cerevisiae 141 during sour-dough fermentation is characterized by an initial death phase (from 2×10^6 to $2 \times$ $10⁵$ c.f.u./g), followed by a second period of growth in which cell numbers return to their initial value. In the present study, gas and ethanol production by S. cerevisiae 141 approached those of commercial baker's yeast even though the latter was used at higher cell concentrations $(3 \times 10^7 \text{ c.f.u./g compared with } 10^5 \text{ to } 10^6 \text{ c.f.u./g}).$

The sour-dough started with the maltose-negative S. exiguus M14 was characterized by very different kinetics (Figure 2A). The V_t value was much lower than that of S. cerevisiae 141 and porosity did not occur (upper and lower lines were superimposed). The very small difference between V_t and V_r values showed that the CO_2 produced was almost totally retained by the sour-dough (Table 2). This absence of porosity explains the unsatisfactory bread-crumb texture obtained. $V_{1/2}$ was 450 ml (83% of the total CO₂), indicating a short ferrnentative activity, probably due to the inability of 5. exiguus M14 to utilize maltose (Sugihara et al. 1970). Saccharomyces cerevisiae 141, after depleting the soluble carbohydrates initially present in the flour, further extends the fermentation by using the maltose released from the damaged starch by the action of α - and β -amylases in the flour. The low fermentative power of S. exiguus was confirmed by the poor ethanol production of 67 mmol/kg (Table 3).

Table 2. Rheofermentometer parameters of sour-doughs started with indlvldual and associated lactic acid bacteria and yeasts.

* The rheofermentometer parameters were not detectable in the sour-dough produced with the homofermentative L. plantarum DC400 strain.

t Sour-dough fermented with added fructose (6 g/kg).

Table 3. pH, cell numbers, lactic acid, acetic acid and ethanol in sour-doughs started with individual and associated lactic acid bacteria and yeasts, after $3 h$ at 28° C. \ddagger

+ The initial pH of the sour-doughs was 5.95.

t The initial cell numbers of lactic acid bacteria and individual yeasts were 1×10^7 and 4×10^7 c.f.u./g (Baker's yeast) or $4 \times$ $10⁶$ c.f.u./g (other yeasts), respectively.

 \ddagger Values in the same column with different superscript letters differ significantly (P < 0.05).

§ Sour-doughs fermented with added fructose (6 g/kg).

ND-not detected.

The rheofermentometer data for L. brevis subsp. lindneri 1×10^7 to 3×10^8 c.f.u./g. The final pH was 4.50, and CB1 produced a low gas release curve (Figure 1B) with a V_i lactic and acetic acid concentrations were 24 and 3.3 mmol/ that was only 22% of that of S. cerevisiae 141 (Table 2). kg, respectively (Table 3), showing that L. brevis subsp. During the 3-h fermentation, cell numbers increased from lindneri CBl was responsible for most of the souring

Figure 1. Gas release curves of sour-doughs produced with: (A) S. cerevisiae 141; (B) L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl; (C) S, cerevisiae 141 and L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl; (D) S. cerevisiae 141 and L. plantarum DC400; and (E) S. cerevisiae 141 and L. brevis subsp. lindneri CB1 in the presence of fructose (6 g/kg).

(Spicher 1983). As Martinez-Anaya et al. (1990) also found, the sour-doughs started with LAB alone gave unsatisfactory breads with flat loaves and coarse crusts and crumbs.

Sour-dough Fermentation by Combined Starters

Since leavening of yeasts is fundamental to obtain good bread production, the effects of combined yeast-LAB starters were compared with those of yeast starters used alone.

Compared with S. cerevisiae 141 alone, the associative growth of S. cerevisiae 141 and L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl decreased the time taken for the gas flow to reach its maximum value ($H_m = 76.1$ mm) from 63 to 21 min (Figure IC) (Table 2). X increased from 1.06 to 3.62 mm/min and 75% of the total amount of $CO₂$ was produced after 1.5 h of fermentation. According to the $CO₂$ production, $> 80\%$ of the total ethanol production was also reached by 1.5 h (data not shown). At the end of fermentation, yeast cell numbers in the dough produced with the mixed starter were similar to those in the dough produced using just the yeast. The decrease in pH caused by L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl (Table 3) was probably responsible for an initial activation of yeast metabolism. Nevertheless, the heterofermentative LAB did not increase the ethanol content and gassing-power of the sour-dough and V_t was similar to that in the sour-dough produced with S. cerevisiae 141 alone. Previous results (Gobbetti et al. 1994b) showed that S. cerevisiae 141 strongly influenced carbohydrate evolution, causing a reduction in the L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl fermentation. Compared with LAB-started sour-dough, lactic and acetic acid productions were lower, at 20 and 2.3 mmol/kg, respectively and bacterial cell numbers were reduced from 3×10^8 to 8×10^7 c.f.u./g (Table 3). Since S. cerevisiae 141 also produces acetic acid (2.3 mmol/kg), the apparent decrease in the bacterial synthesis of this acid in dough produced by the mixed starter was probably under-estimated.

The positive influence of L. brevis subsp. lindneri CB1 on the sour-dough was strengthened when this LAB was associated with maltose-negative S. exiguus M14. H_{m} , T_1 and X were 47.6 mm, 33 min and 1.44 mm/min, respectively, in dough produced with S. exiguus M14 alone, compared with 58.4 mm, IS min and 3.89 mm/min, respectively, in the combined fermentation (Figure 2C) (Table 2). Probably due to the lack of competition for the wheat soluble carbohydrates, since maltose is the preferred energy source for L. brevis subsp. lindneri, V_t (860 ml) as well as ethanol concentration

Figure 2. Gas release curves of sour-doughs produced with: (A) S. exiguus M14; (B) L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl; and (C) S. exiguus Ml4 and L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl.

(94 mmol/kg) (Table 3) were about the sum of those produced by each microorganism alone. Porosity appeared $(T_r =$ 68 min) and the sour-dough achieved a satisfactory texture. Not only was fermentation accelerated, as seen when the combined S. cerevisiac 141-L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl starter was used, but this combination also benefited from the lack of competition between many of the metabolic demands of the two microorganisms. Bacterial cell numbers and organic acid production were the same as when L . brevis subsp. lindneri CBl was used alone (Table 3).

When $L.$ plantarum DC400 was combined with $S.$ exiguus Ml4 it produced a dough similar to that fermented by the yeast alone (data not shown). However, the presence of this LAB positively modified S. cerevisiae 141 fermentation; in agreement with Hansen ef al. (1989), who demonstrated a greater adaptability of yeasts to grow in association with homofermentative rather than with heterofermentative LAB, H_m in the presence of L. plantarum DC400, increased from 66.7 to 78.6 mm at the same T_1 and V_t reached 1591 ml with porosity appearing at 37 min (Figure 1D) (Table 2). The gas release curve was characterized by an inflection point at about 45 min of fermentation, and the

same kinetics was observed with the S. cerevisiae 141-L. farciminis CF3 association. The sour-dough produced with S. cerevisiae 141-L. plantarum DC400 contained more lactic acid (16 mmol/kg) than that produced by L . brevis subsp. lindneri CBl-S. cerevisiae 141 (Table 3). While acetic acid, which is mainly produced by heterofermentative LAB, is responsible for a shorter and harder gluten, lactic acid can gradually account for a more elastic gluten structure (Stegemann & Rohrlich 1958; Lorenz 1983). With the supplementary maltose from starch hydrolysis, this elastic structure retains the CO, produced during the last fermentation phase and characterizes the gas release curves of Figure 1D. Neither cell numbers of L. planfarum DC400 nor lactic acid production decreased when this LAB was grown in association with S. cerevisiae 141 (Table 3).

Sour-dough Fermentation in the Presence of Fructose

Since it was previously demonstrated (Gobbetti et al. 1995) that the addition of fructose to dough increased acetic acid production by L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl and enhanced the fermentation quotient (the molar ratio between lactic and acetic acids) the effect of fructose on the leavening kinetics of a starter of L. brevis subsp. lindneri CB1 and/or S. cerevisiae 141 was also evaluated. Addition of fructose to the sour-dough produced using L. brevis subsp. lindneri CBl alone increased acetic acid production (from 3.3 to 15 mmol/kg) and cell numbers (from 3×10^8 to 2 \times 10° c.f.u./g), decreased ethanol production from 31 to 12 mmol/kg (Table 3), slightly increased CO, production $(V_f$ increasing from 311 to 345 ml) and almost doubled the gas production rate (X increasing from 0.43 to 0.84 mm/ min) (Table 2). Although addition of fructose to dough started with just S. cerevisiae 141 had no effect on the cell counts, it increased the final amount of ethanol produced and the leavening resulted in the highest V_i value (1789 ml) for any sour-dough produced (Tables 2 and 3). Addition of sucrose, glucose and maltose to doughs also stimulated yeast fermentation but did not cause similar increases in bacterial activity (data not shown). Lacfobacillus brevis subsp. lindneri CBl has the capacity to co-ferment fructose in the presence of maltose (Gobbetti et al. 1995). Fructose, in part, pushes the metabolism toward the acetate kinase pathway, producing traces of mannitol, increasing acetic acid production and reducing ethanol concentration. In sour-doughs produced with the combined starter, addition of fructose accelerated starter activity (after 21 min of fermentation the maximum value of gaseous flow increased from 76.1 to 87.2 mm with a flow speed of 4.15 mm/min) (Figure 1E) (Table 2), produced the highest ethanol concentration observed and ensured the appropriate LAB fermentation in terms of pH, cell numbers and lactic and acetic acid production (Table 3).

This study is the first in which a rheofermentometer was used to characterize the leavening of sour-doughs by LAB and yeast starters. This made it relatively easy to evaluate starter performance and this should facilitate production of better sour-dough bread.

Acknowledgements

The present research was supported by National Research Council of Italy, Special Project RAISA, Sub project 4, Paper n 2314. The authors gratefully acknowledge the technical assistance of D. Babou, S. Theodorakis and L. Mariotti.

References

- Akdogan, H. & Ozilgen, M. 1992 Kinetics of microbial growth, gas production, and dough volume increase during leavening. Enzyme and Microbial Technology 14, 141-143.
- Barber, S., Baguena, R., Martinez-Anaya, M.A. & Tomer, M.J. 1983 Microflora of the sour dough of wheat flour bread. I. Identification and functional properties of microorganisms of industrial sourdoughs. Revista de Agroquimica y Tecnologia de Alimenfos 23, 552-562.
- Corsetti, A., Gobbetti, M. & Rossi, J. 1994 Sourdough fermentation in presence of added soluble carbohydrates. Microbiologie-Aliments-Nutrition 12, 377-385.
- Devoyod, J.J. & Desmazeaud, M. 1971 Les associations microbiennes dans le fromage de Roquefort. III. Action des enterocoques et des levures fermentant le lactose vis-a-vis des lactobacilles. Le Lait 507,399-415.
- Galli, A., Franzetti, L. & Fortina, M.G. 1988 Isolation and identification of sourdough microflora. Microbiologie-Aliments--Nutrition 6, 345-351.
- Gobbetti, M. 1992 Dinamica della popolazione microbica durante la fermentazione per la produzione di kefir. Il Mondo del latte 8, 635-640.
- Gobbetti, M. & Rossi, J. 1991 The sour-dough microorganisms: lactic acid bacteria and yeasts. In Lactic 91. Lactic Acid Bacteria. Research and Industrial Applications in the Agro-food Industries poster 35 12-13 September 1991, Région Basse-Normandie, Caen, Normandy, France.
- Gobbetti, M. Corsetti, A. & Rossi, J. 1994a The sourdough microflora. Interactions between lactic acid bacteria and yeasts: metabolism of carbohydrates. Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology 41,456-460.
- Gobbetti, M., Corsetti, A. & Rossi, J. 1994b The sourdough microflora. Evolution of soluble carbohydrates during the sourdough fermentation. Microbiologie--Aliments-Nutrition 12, 9-15.
- Gobbetti, M., Çorsetti, A. & Rossi, J. 1994c The sourdough microflora. Interactions between lactic acid bacteria and yeasts: metabolism of amino acids. World Journal of Microbiology and Biotechnology 10, 275-279.
- Gobbetti, M., Corsetti, A. & Rossi, J. 1995 Maltose-fructose cofermentation by Lactobacillus brevis subsp. lindneri CB1 fructosenegative strain. Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology 42, 939- 944.
- Gobbetti, M., Corsetti, A., Rossi, J., La Rosa, F. & De Vincenzi, S. 1994d Identification and clustering of lactic acid bacteria and yeasts from wheat sourdoughs of central Italy. Italian Journal of Food Science 1, 85-94.
- Hansen, A., Lund, B. & Lewis, H.J. 1989 Flavour production and acidification of sourdoughs in relation to starter culture and fermentation temperature. Lebensmittel-Wissenschaft und Technologie 22, 145-149.
- Kline, L. & Sugihara, T.F. 1971 Microorganisms of the San Francisco sourdough bread process. II. Isolation and characterization of undescribed bacterial species responsible for souring activity. Applied and Environmental Microbiology 21, 459-465.
- Lorenz, K. 1983 Sourdough processes. Methodology and biochemistry. Baker's Digest 55, 32-36.
- Martinez-Anaya, M.A., Pitarch, B., Bayarri, P. & Benedito De Barber, C. 1990 Microflora of the sourdoughs of wheat flour bread. X. Interactions between yeasts and lactic acid bacteria in wheat doughs and their effects on bread quality. Cereal Chemisfry 67, 85-91.
- Obelman, H. 1985 Fermented milks. In Microbiology of Fermented Foods, ed Wood, B.J.B. pp. 167-196. London: Elsevier Applied Science.
- Salovaara, H. 1993 Lactic acid bacteria in cereal-based products. In Lactic Acid Bacteria, eds. Salminen, S. & Von Wright, A. pp. 111-126. New York: Marcel Dekker.
- Sarra, P.G., Pattarini, F., Bortolotti, F. & Romani, A. 1992 Caratterizzazione di lattobacilli isolati da madri acide. Industrie Alimentari 31,882-887.
- Spicher, G. 1983 Baked goods. In Biotechnology, Vol. 5, ed Reed, G. pp. I-80. Weinheim: Verlag Chemie.
- Spicher, G. 1987 The microflora of sourdough. XXII. Communication: the Lactobacillus species of wheat sourdough. Zeifschrift für Lebensmittel--Untersuchung und -Forschung 184, 300-303.
- Spicher, G. & Pomeranz, U. 1985 Bread and other baked products. In Ulmann's Encyclopedia of Industrial Chemistry pp. 331-389. Weinheim: VCH.
- Stanton, A.G. 1988 Statistica per Discipline Biomediche. Milan: McGraw-Hill.
- Stegemann, J. & Rohrlich, M. 1958 Uber vermchrung der sauerteigorganismen in vaerlange der teigganmg bei Kontinuierlicher fuhrung. Brot und Geback 12, 65-76.
- Sugihara, T.F., Kline, L. & McCready, L.B. 1970 Nature of the San Francisco sourdough French bread process. II. Microbiological aspects. Bakers' Digesf 44, 51-56.
- Sugihara, T.F., Kline, L. & Miller, M.W. 1971 Microorganisms of the San Francisco sour dough bread process. I. Yeast responsible for the leavening action. Applied Microbiology 21, 456-458.
- Wood, B.J.B. & Hodge, M.M. 1985 Yeast-lactic acid bacteria interactions and their contribution to fermented foodstuffs. In Microbiology of Fermented Foods, ed Wood B.J.B. pp. 263-293. London: Elsevier Applied Science.
- Yondem, F., Ozilgen, M. & Bozoglu, F. 1992 Kinetic aspects of leavening with mixed cultures of Lactobacillus plantarum and Saccharomyces cerevisiae. Lebensmittel-Wissenschaft und Technologie 25, 162-167.

(Received in revised form 14 April 1995; accepted 3 June 1995)