

Engineering Geology 51 (1999) 291–302

Response of landfill clay liners to extended periods of freezing

Carol J. Miller ^{a,*}, Jai-Young Lee b

a *Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Wayne State University, Detroit, MI 48202, USA* b *Department of Environmental Engineering, Seoul City University, Seoul, South Korea*

Received 20 August 1998; accepted 9 September 1998

Abstract

This paper presents the results of a physical model study of the performance of landfill clay cover liners subjected to extended freezing periods. Three proposed designs for a prototype cover liner were evaluated with a primary objective being the determination of frost penetration resulting from the sub-freezing temperatures imposed as an upper boundary condition to the model. The ultimate performance of the three liner designs were compared on the basis of frost penetration, leakage through the liner, and frost heave. The observed depth of frost penetration was compared to that predicted using a simplified analytical solution of the thermodynamic problem, in addition to measured field behavior.

The laboratory experiment utilizes a 1.8 m² tank, of ca 2.1 m depth. The tank is loaded with clay to the specifications required for landfill liners. Three different landfill cover liner designs were modeled in the experimental tank. The performance of the three designs, as measured by a variety of observations, were compared. Frost heave was measured for each design and was found to vary between 3.8 and 4.3 cm. The results indicate the depth of frost penetration was similar for all designs tested (29.2–31.7 cm), although the design which included a soil drainage layer had superior leakage performance. © 1999 Elsevier Science B.V. All rights reserved.

Keywords: Freezing; Frost action; Frost heaving; Frozen ground; Landfills; Permeability; Thermal conductivity

phenomena. This failure may include cracking, soil

1. Introduction to the growth of ice crystals and that excessive heaving is explained by the segregation of water One of the primary mechanisms of landfill clay as it freezes (Taber, 1929). Segregation of water cover liner failure in cold regions is the freeze/thaw on freezing causes shrinkage cracks below if the phenomena. This failure may include cracking, soil supply of water is limited or if the soil is very heaving, permeability increase and/or strength impermeable. Laboratory studies have cited decrease. There have been many investigations of increases in permeability of one to two orders of decrease. There have been many investigations of increases in permeability of one to two orders of
the soil/water processes involved in freeze/thaw magnitude following freeze/thaw (Chamberlain the soil/water processes involved in freeze/thaw. magnitude following freeze/thaw (Chamberlain
In 1929 one of the pioneers Taber reported that and Gow, 1979; Chamberlain et al., 1990; Zimmie In 1929, one of the pioneers, Taber, reported that and Gow, 1979; Chamberlain et al., 1990; Zimmie pressure increases are associated with freezing due and LaPlante, 1990). The total effect is dependent on soil type, moistu and possibly, rate. Konrad (1989) found that $\overline{f_{\text{rel}: +1313}}$ 5773876; Fax: +1 313 5773881; freeze/thaw caused significant changes in the soil e-mail: cmiller@ce.eng.wayne.edu structure of a saturated clayey silt consolidated to

investigated the mechanical failure of frozen soil minimizing the effect of freezing and thawing on and related this failure to the influence of the permeability. They observed that freeze/thaw had duration and temperature of the freezing condi- an effect of increasing the permeability of comtion. Penner (1986) studied the ice lensing phenom- pacted clay by a factor of two orders of magnitude enon in layered soils and the impact of lensing on or more. The actual effect was dependent on the frost heaving. The heaving noted for fine-textured type of clay and the initial condition of the clay (clay) soils was much more significant than for sample. As part of their research, compaction coarse-textured (silt) soils. Such fine-textured soils criteria were developed to address the permeability are the type typically used in landfill cover liner changes. In general, the more densely compacted construction. Landfill clay cover liner conditions a soil, the less permeability change that occurs. are much different than those investigated in many Kim and Daniel (1992) also report on the effects of the previous freeze/thaw studies. The landfill of freezing on hydraulic conductivity of compacted problem is not represented well by a single cell of clay. In that research, the focus was on the influmonolithic soil, as various soil layers are incorpo- ence of freeze/thaw for soils of varying moisture rated in a typical landfill cover liner. Moreover, content and the subsequent change of soil strucmany of the laboratory studies have been limited ture. As in previous studies, the hydraulic conducto small samples and are typically of the scale used tivity was shown to increase for all soil samples
in triaxial testing and permeability testing. after freezing and thawing. Benson and Othman Therefore, the applicability of the results to landfill (1993) report that freezing and thawing affects the cover liners can be questioned. The present investi- structure and hydraulic conductivity of compacted gation utilized large scale laboratory testing with clay both on laboratory samples and in the field. the actual depth of a cover liner, layered soil When they froze the clay at a rate of 0.3 h, the profiles, and boundary conditions similar to those reported increase in hydraulic conductivity was in encountered in the landfill. The range of one order of magnitude or more.

2. Background phenomena.

penetrates the ground surface, causing the upward can be detrimental in numerous ways to the integmigration of soil moisture. A significant body of rity of any soil structure, especially fine-textured literature is available describing the mechanisms (clay) soils. This has lead to serious concern regardof moisture migration through frozen soil. Various ing the integrity of landfill covers constructed with theories attribute movement to a thermal gradient clay soil. Cover liner design guidelines (e.g. US where capillary flow is in the direction from higher EPA, 1991) have recently included freeze/thaw as to lower temperatures, and to osmotic flow. an area of focus. Most standards stipulate a mini-Ferguson et al. (1964) reported that water moves mum thickness and depth of cover liner to accomto a frozen zone when water in the unfrozen zone modate the possible action of freeze/thaw. This is held at low tensions. However, the amount of thickness criteria is expected to allow for some movement may depend on the available soil/water, degradation of the upper portions of the cover the temperatures of the frozen zone, the duration liner, while ensuring that a portion of the cover of freezing and the physical and chemical proper- liner is beyond the influence of freeze/thaw. ties of the soil. The freezing effects on soil are However, there has been only very limited research primarily dependent on the soil's chemical and into the depth of frost propagation into cover physical properties and moisture conditions as well liners. Most guidelines rely on frost penetration as on the freezing rate. Chamberlain and Ayorinde data and prediction methods used in the construc- (1991) studied the effects of freeze/thaw cycles on tion industry, such as the US Department of

various overconsolidation ratios. Jessberger (1980) clay layers and the compaction requirements for after freezing and thawing. Benson and Othman Benson and Othman (1993) also studied the development of cracks associated with the freeze/thaw

As revealed in this literature review, there is When air temperatures are below freezing, frost wide consensus that cyclic freezing and thawing Commerce Weather Bureau data (Jumikis, 1966). to a continuous water supply during the freezing This source suggest the depth of frost penetration process. The details of the experimental tank are in the Detroit area is 127 cm (55[%]). Typical con-
shown in Fig. 1. struction projects, such as the placement of buried pipelines and foundation design utilize such data. However, frost penetration through cover liners at *3.2. Liner designs* landfills may be quite different than observed in other fields of the construction industry. In fact, Three different cover liner configurations were measured frost penetration depths at a landfill site investigated. These designs were selected jointly by maintained by City Management Corporation CMC and the research team. The three designs (CMC) in southeastern Michigan registered a max- are indicated in Fig. $2(a-c)$. Design No. 1 corresimum depth of frost penetration of 32 cm (Song, ponds to the most simplistic cover system, while 1992), significantly less than the published depth design No. 2 includes a protective barrier layer of frost penetration (127 cm). This variation may between the topsoil and clay. Design No. 3 involves be attributed to the soil layers and elevated temper- the most complex system of layering and includes atures at the lower boundary of the landfill cover a lateral drainage layer above the clay liner to system (i.e. decomposing waste). Benson et al. limit fluid pressures above the clay. (1995) measured similar depths of frost penetration (maximum depth of 45 cm) at a site in the midwestern USA. *3.3. Thermodynamic conditions*

Thermodynamic numerical simulations and analytical methods can be used to estimate the depth The simulations were required to reproduce of frost penetration in soil. Analytical methods thermodynamic conditions at a central location generally rely on the freezing index as a necessary within the cover, that is, near the crown of the input parameter. The freezing index is the sum of cell. At a central location, the heat flux is primarily the degree-days of frost for a given period and is in a vertical direction. Therefore, the outer boundusually evaluated from the mean daily temper- aries of the test cell were insulated to provide a ature. The present research provides a study of the ''no-flow'' thermodynamic condition. The upper utility of the analytic approach to prediction of boundary condition was reflective of a severe frost penetration in landfill cover liners, while also Michigan winter, providing a worst case analysis. indicating changes in gross performance measures Although the objective was to maintain a temperattributed to frost penetration. ature of -12.1° C in the air space above the cover

components; a steel frame and Plexiglas walls. The temperature, increasing the predicted depth of steel frame supports the Plexiglas walls that are frost penetration. Thermocouples manufactured insulated with 5.1 cm of styrofoam and 15.2 cm of by Yellow Springs Instruments Company, YSI fiberglass (*R*-value 22). The tank has a surface Series 701, were located at three different sites dimension of $0.76 \text{ m} \times 2.4 \text{ m}$, and a depth of ca within the clear space above the cover liner to 2.1 m. Tank space is reserved for the temperature assess the uniformity of temperatures within this controlled regions at the upper and lower bound- space. Additional thermocouples were used to aries of the tank. The tank is used to simulate monitor the temperatures along a vertical crossclosed system freezing, meaning there is not access section within the cover liner (Fig. 2).

liner, it fluctuated slightly over time. The lower boundary condition was an applied temperature **3. Experimental design Service 20.9°C, approximating temperature measure**ments at the liner/waste interface of landfills oper-*3.1. Experimental tank* ated by CMC in metropolitan Detroit, MI (USA) (Lee, 1994). Older landfills, with a reduced level The experimental tank consists of two structural of biological activity, would exhibit a lower waste

Fig. 1. Insulated tank for freeze/thaw investigations.

to limit the influx of atmospheric and surface rotating anode powder diffractometer with monotion rate. The remainder of the design details are in a Unified Soil Classification of CL-ML. presented in Fig. 1.

3.4. Rainfall simulations mineralogical compositions of the clay, silt and sand fractions were determined by X-ray diffrac-The primary function of a landfill cover liner is tion analysis with a Rigaku (Danvers, MA) RU200 moisture to the deposited waste. Influx through chromatic Cu K α X-radiation, after pretreatment the cover liner is termed ''leakage'' while the to remove soluble salts, carbonates, organic matter resulting liquid in the landfill is termed ''leachate''. and Fe oxides (Kunze, 1965). The clay fraction of Minimization of leakage generally leads to the the cover liner material was predominately illite minimization of leachate, and hence a reduction (64%), with approximately equal amounts of in groundwater contamination potential. One of kaolinite and chlorite (10%). The remainder was the objectives of this project was the determination comprised of smaller quantities of quartz, hornof the change in leakage through the clay cover blende, microcline and plagioclase. The clay liner liner attributed to freeze/thaw degradation of the was also characterized in terms of the soil-to-water cover system. This required the simulation of hydraulic conductivity using ASTM standard D rainfall, and the measurement of the resulting 5084-90 (ASTM, 1994a), resulting in a value of surface runoff and leakage. A double length of 10^{-8} cm s⁻¹. The optimum moisture content was perforated PVC pipe, as shown in the schematic ca 13%, with a maximum dry density of of Fig. 1, was used to apply the simulated rainfall. 1928 kg m−3, as determined following ASTM stan-A submersible pump provides the energy to pass dard D 698-91 (ASTM, 1994b). Analysis of the the water through this system, at a preset applica- particle size distribution (ASTM, 1994c) resulted

4.2. Compaction

4. Materials and placement Compaction of the clay lifts was accomplished external to the tank, in a 1.2 m by 0.76 m wooden *4.1. Materials* tray of 0.152 m height. Compaction utilized a power hammer with a 0.09 m^2 head. The average All soils were obtained from borrow areas main- thickness of each compacted lift was 10.1 cm. tained for clay liner construction at landfills oper- Moisture content and density determinations were ated by CMC in southeastern Michigan. The made for each of the six lifts placed in the tanks.

Fig. 2. (a) Design No. 1 for cover liner simulations. (b) Design No. 2 for cover liner simulations. (c) Design No. 3 for cover liner simulations.

measurement and frost penetration appears in the following sections. propagated into the clay layer of this design.

cycles, were simulated for each of the three designs. densation on the refrigeration coil external to the Fig. $3(a-c)$ displays the time history of rainfall tank. Drainage was measured as the lateral outflow inputs and leakage outputs for each of the designs. from the drainage layer of design No. 3 (Fig. 2). In this application, leakage is defined as the A second collection system, similar to the surface amount of fluid collected in the leakage collection runoff collection system of Fig. 2, was included to system at the base of the tank (Fig. 1). At a provide this measurement. Moisture increase repsystem at the base of the tank (Fig. 1). At a prototype landfill, this leakage would mix with the resents the difference in moisture retained by the waste deposited in the landfill, emerging as poten-
clay cover liner before and after the simulation. A tially hazardous leachate. The leakage perfor- positive value indicates that the overall moisture mance is defined as the percentage of available content of the cover liner increased during the inflow that exits the system as leakage. The avail- simulation.

Table 1

The density exceeded the 90% modified Proctor able inflow is the value of the applied rainfall less density (ASTM, 1994b), at moisture contents the surface runoff, representing the moisture availslightly greater than optimum. The final moisture able to migrate through the cover liner. Surface contents at the conclusion of each experiment were runoff was measured using the collection system sampled to provide the necessary data for a water shown in Fig. 2. Designs Nos 1 and 2 were very balance, as provided in the following section. Similar in regards to the leakage performance (ca 19% for both cases) while design No. 3 had significantly less leakage (ca 3%). This suggests the **5. Experimental results** drainage layer included in design No. 3 was very effective in removing potential leakage from the The overall performance results for the three system before it had an opportunity to migrate cover liners appears in Table 1. Detailed analysis through the clay. It may also be true that the clay of the experimental results in the areas of flow liner of design No. 3 was more effective at "hold-
measurement and frost penetration appears in the ling-up" the leakage because the frost had not

Other elements of the system water balance *5.1. Flow measurement* shown in Table 1 include evaporation, drainage, moisture increase and excess moisture. Four rainfall events, separated by freeze/thaw Evaporation was determined by measuring con-

Performance based comparison of three clay cover liner designs

Fig. 3. (a) Measured leakage through the clay liner for design No. 1. (b) Measured Leakage through the Clay Liner for design No. 2. (c) Measured drainage above the clay liner and leakage through the clay liner for design No. 3.

One measure of the experimental error associ- tigation can be compared to previous research, ated with the flow portion of the study is the both analytical and field-based. One analytical unaccounted moisture (termed excess moisture in technique frequently used for the prediction of Table 1) from the water balance. This moisture frost penetration is the Stefan equation (Jumikis, can be determined as: 1966). However, because it is an analytical tech-

A primary focus of this project was evaluation
of the depth of frost penetration resulting from
of the depth of frost penetration resulting from
continuous freezing periods. Fig. 4(a-c) displays
This comparison upports the

coolest average freezing period temperature,
 -13.0° C. The depth of frost penetration was

similar for all designs, ca 30 cm. This resulted in

freezing of a portion of the clay liner of designs

Need and 2. However, Nos 1 and 2. However, the freezing zone was not a simulated cover liner of fine-textured soil. The sable to penetrate the clay liner of design No 3 maximum depth of frost penetration measured was

designs is nearly linear, as shown at the selected face. Therefore, their set-up did not simulate the times of Fig. $5(a-c)$. The profile associated with thermodynamic control afforded by decomposing times of Fig. $5(a-c)$. The profile associated with thermodynamic control afford deciments of $\frac{1}{2}$ which has the most complex layering waste beneath the cover liner. design No. 3, which has the most complex layering waste beneath the cover liner.

of soil types, deviates most significantly from a line field measurements at an instrumented landfill of soil types, deviates most significantly from a linear variation. This deviation can be attributed cross-section, the CMC investigation (Song, 1992) to the change in thermal conductivity in moving reported a maximum depth of frost penetration of from layer to layer. ca 32 cm for an average daily air temperature of

nique, it requires significant assumptions be made
that render it much less applicable for the cover –Drainage–Moisture Increase liner problem. One such assumption, of a semi-The percentage error, calculated as the percent of
rainfall unaccounted in the water balance, varies
between 0.50 and 2.43% for the three cover liner
simulations. The unaccounted moisture is a rela-
tively small fraction o Stefan formula to overpredict the depth of frost
5.2. Frost penetration penetration. An application of Stefan's formula

able to penetrate the clay liner of design No. 3,
due to the additional depth of cover materials used
in design No. 3 [Fig. 2(c)].
The temperature profile for each of the three likely due to the absence of the liner/waste The temperature profile for each of the three likely due to the absence of the liner/waste inter-
signs is nearly linear, as shown at the selected face. Therefore, their set-up did not simulate the

The frost penetration observations of this inves- -25.3° C for a duration of ca 30 days. The cover

Fig. 4. (a) Soil temperature history for design No. 1. (b) Soil temperature history for design No. 2. (c) Soil temperature history for design No. 3.

liner was similar to that of design No. 1. The field measured frost penetration depth is comparable to measurements of the present study.

5.3. Frost heave

Several locations of frost heave appeared with corresponding disruption of the surface. The magnitude of frost heave varied between 3.8 and 4.4 cm as shown in Table 1. Design No. 1, with the clay material closest to the ground surface, registered the greatest frost heave. This finding supports the theory that frost heave is more significant in finetextured soils. The observed frost heave was highly variable over the cover liner surface, with some regions experiencing negligible heave. This may reflect the inherent difficulty in achieving uniform placement conditions (density and moisture content) throughout the cover liner. The observed locations of frost heave appeared to remain unchanged following multiple cycles of freeze/thaw. In landfill cover liner applications, the primary concern associated with frost heave of this magnitude relates to the increase in permeability associated with frost heave. It is expected that infiltration to the waste will be greatest at locations of the cover liner affected by frost heave. The drainage system of this experimental set-up did not allow isolation of the portion of flow through the heaved region. However, the observations indicate that the damage due to frost heave is limited to the upper 5 cm of the clay liner. The total depth of the compacted clay liner in this experimental simulation, as well as at many landfill facilities, is on the order of 60 cm. Therefore, an extensive buffer of non-damaged clay remains between the surface of the liner and the base of the liner. There is not expected to be an immediately discernable correspondence between rainfall and leakage observed at the base of the liner, due to this buffer. However, over a period of many years and numer ous freeze/thaw cycles, the moisture will make Fig. 5. (a) Soil temperature profile for design No. 1. (b) Soil
temperature profile is way to lower regions of the liner, increasing
for design No. 3.
for design No. 3. Subsequently, there is expected to be noticeable increases of leakage at the base of the liner due to

fluid migration through the damaged portion of with the damaged liner regions acting as high the liner. permeability conduits for by-pass flow.

6. Conclusions References

It was the purpose of the research described ASTM, 1994a. Test Method for Measurement of Hydraulic herein to provide a comparative analysis of three Conductivity of Saturated Porous Materials Using a Flexible

different landfill cover liner degions The primery Wall Permeameter. ASTM Standard No. D 5084-90, Annual different landfill cover liner designs. The primary
basis for the comparison is the frost penetration
characteristics of the liners. Therefore, the average
deristics of Soil Using Modified Effort (2.700 kN-m/m³). air temperature maintained for each design was ASTM Standard No. D 1557-91, Annual Book of ASTM similar. Although the depth of frost penetration Standards. ASTM, Philadelphia, PA.
similar for all decision texted the fraction region and ASTM. 1994c. Method for Particle-size Analysis of Soils was similar for all designs tested, the freezing zone
never propagated into the clay of Design No. 3
because of its depth. It appears that even had the
henson, C.H., Othman, M.A., 1993. Hydraulic conductivity test been performed for a much greater period of of compacted clay frozen and thawed in situ. Journal of time the clay would have remained unfrozen with Geotechnical Engineering 119 (2), 276–294. time, the clay would have remained unfrozen, with Geotechnical Engineering 119 (2), 276–294.

Renson, C.H., Abichou, T.H., Olson, M.A., Bosscher, P.J., a steady state condition having been achieved.

Table 1 provides a performance-based comparison

of the three liner designs.

An additional objective of this research was to

An additional objective of this research was to

evaluate the correspondence between observed Sodhi, D.S. (Ed.), Proceedings of the 6th International Spe-
frost papertration denths with those predicted and cially Conference, pp. 136–151. frost penetration depths with those predicted ana-
lytically and those measured in the field. The frost
thawing on the permeability and structure of soils. Engineerpenetration observations of the experimental ing Geology 13, 73–92. set-up were found to correspond closely to meas- Chamberlain, E.J., Iskandar, I., Hunsicker, S.E. 1990. Effect of urements at local field sites. However, the analyti-

freeze–thaw cycles on the permeability and macrostructure

of soils. In: Proc. Int. Symp. on Frozen Soil Impacts on cal model used in the study significantly
underpredicted the depth of frost penetration. It
is recommended that more sophisticated models
is recommended that more sophisticated models
is recommended that more sophisticated that incorporate more features of the field problem Ferguson, H., Brown, P.L., Dickey, D.D., 1964. Water move-(including a lower boundary condition that simu-
lates the temperature of the decomposing waste) ety Proceedings 645, 700–703.

varied throughout the surface of each of the three Jumikis, A.R., 1966. Thermal Soil Mechanics. Rutgers Univerliners, although the locations of maximum disrup-
tion for each liner recorded similar heaves to Kim, W., Daniel, D.E., 1992. Effects of freezing on hydraulic tion for each liner recorded similar heaves — to
conductivity of compacted clay. Journal of Geotechnical
distribution of the state of the the order of 4.0 cm. It did not appear that the
frost heave affected the magnitude of leakage
Konrad, J.M., 1989. Physical processes during freeze-thaw collected at the base the clay liner, suggesting that cycles in clayey silts. Cold Regions Science and Technology the damage was limited to surficial disruption that $\frac{16, 291-303}{16, 291-303}$.
tungs buffored by the autonoius clay danth associated Kunze, G.W., 1965. Pretreatments for mineralogical analysis. was buffered by the extensive clay depth associated
with each liner design. However, it is expected that
Agron. Monogr. 9, ASA, Madison, WI, pp. 568–577. the presence of multiple freeze/thaw cycles over Lee, J.Y., 1994. Performanace of landfill cover systems in cold many years would impact the measured leakage, climates. Ph.D. dissertation. Department of Civil and Envi-

-
-
-
-
-
- on clay covers and liners. Cold Regions Engineering. In:
-
-
-
- lates the temperature of the decomposing waste)
be used in future applications.
The magnitude of frost heave measurements
The magnitude of frost heave measurements
gy 3 (1), 3–27.
	-
	-
	-
	-
	-

MI, USA. 428–461.
Miller, C.J., Lee, J.Y., 1997. Depth of frost penetration in land- US EPA, 19

- iller, C.J., Lee, J.Y., 1997. Depth of frost penetration in land-
fill cover systems. Environmental Engineering Science 14 of RCRA/CERCLA Final Covers. EPA/625/4-91/025. fill cover systems. Environmental Engineering Science 14 of RCRA/CERCLA Final Covers, EPA/625/4-91/025.

Zimmie. T.F., LaPlante, C., 1990. The effect of freeze-
-
- ng, K.H., 1992. Field Study of Ground Temperatures. Report sity, Philadelphia, PA, pp. 580–593. prepared for City Management Corporation, Detroit, MI, USA.

ronmental Engineering. Wayne State University, Detroit, Taber, S., 1929. Frost heaving. Journal of Geology 37 (1),

-
- Zimmie, T.F., LaPlante, C., 1990. The effect of freeze-thaw Penner, E., 1986. Ice lensing in layered soils. Canadian Geotech- cycles on the permeability of a fine-grained soil. In: Proc.
22 (2) 22 (2) 22 (2) Mid-Atlantic Industrial Waste Conf. Drevel Univernical Journal 23 (3), 334–340.

22nd Mid-Atlantic Industrial Waste Conf., Drexel Univer-

22nd Mid-Atlantic Industrial Waste Conf., Drexel Univer-

22nd Mid-Atlantic Industrial Waste Conf., Drexel Univer-